

Tenth New Beethoven Research Conference

Palmer House Hilton Hotel, Chicago

November 13-14, 2024

Location: Marshfield

Sponsored by the American Beethoven Society, the University of Alabama, the Krown Klein endowment fund at UCLA's Herb Alpert School of Music, and a generous private donation.*

PROGRAM

Wednesday, November 13

9:00 a.m. to 12:00 noon

Session 1: Primary Sources and Works in Context

Session chair: John D. Wilson

9:00–9:30 “Acoustical Bedlam: A Contextualization of Beethoven’s Christus”

Leanna York (Indiana University Jacobs School of Music)

9:45–10:15 “Listening to Fidelio in Occupied Vienna”

Kirby Haugland (Indiana University Jacobs School of Music)

10:30–11:00 “‘Lost & Found’. Missing Documents for the Last Piano Sonatas”

Federica Rovelli (University of Pavia-Cremona)

11:15–11:45 “Creating Genius: Beethoven, Ossian, and the Formation of the Musical-Genius Construct”

Paul Moulton (The College of Idaho)

Wednesday, November 13

2:00 p.m. to 5:00 p.m.

Session 2: Beethoven from Bonn and Vienna to the Present

Session chair: David Levy

2:00–2:30 “‘The German Children of Israel’—Jewish Sources from late-Eighteenth Century Bonn and their Significance for Beethoven Studies”
Yishai Rubin (Indiana University Jacobs School of Music)

2:45–3:15 “Concert Life in Vienna 1780-1830: Database Presentation and its Implications for Beethoven Research”
Mary Kirchdorfer and Cheston Humphries (University of Vienna)

3:30–4:00 “Political, Moral, and Religious Reflections on Beethoven in the First Musicological Reception Study: *Das romantische Beethovenbild* (1927)”
Sebastian Pstrokowski-Komar (Leipzig University)

4:15–4:45 “The Darker Side of Being Haydn’s Friends”
Fabio Morabito (University of Alberta)

Thursday, November 14

9:00 a.m. to 12:00 noon

Session 3: The Ninth Symphony

Session chair: Erica Buurman

9:00–9:30 “O Friends, Not These SOUNDS: Ignaz Moscheles’s Organ Part, Bowdlerism, and Synesthetic Experiences of the Ninth Symphony in Early Nineteenth-Century London”
Heeseung Lee (University of Northern Colorado)

9:45–10:15 “The *Alla marcia* in Context”
Jos van der Zanden (University of Manchester)

10:30–11:00 “The Ninth Symphony in ‘Tempus Angustiis’”
David Levy (Professor Emeritus, Wake Forest University)

Keynote Address

11:15–12:00 “The Narrative and Musical Debt of Wagner’s Ring to Beethoven’s Ninth”
Christopher Reynolds (Professor Emeritus, University of California, Davis)

Abstracts

Session 1: Primary Sources and Works in Context

“Acoustical Bedlam: A Contextualization of Beethoven’s Christus”

Leanna York (Indiana University Jacobs School of Music)

The premiere of Beethoven’s *Christus am Ölberge* at the Theater an den Wien on April 5, 1803, marked the composer’s first and only contribution to the complex tradition of the German oratorio. Since the genre’s inception at the turn of the eighteenth century, it has reflected theological, political, philosophical, and literary controversies of its day.

Beethoven’s chosen theme, the passion of Christ, came with its own set of ever-shifting compositional and textual expectations, influenced by older traditions of sepolcri and staged oratorios (apparently common at the court of the elector of Cologne after mid-century) and lyric works such as Graun’s revolutionary setting of Ramler’s *Der Tod Jesu* and Andreas Romberg’s setting of Klopstock’s *Der Messias*. Perhaps, as Alan Tyson suggested in his 1970 essay, Beethoven did not fully understand the complex web of oratorio conventions. Yet the composer’s unique approach to the genre—involving its libretto, narrative setting and characters, stage directions, musical structures—and the work’s mixed reception all reflect controversies of Beethoven’s time and place.

My research brings together networks of people, performances, scores, and literature that shaped Beethoven’s understanding of the oratorio genre. The influence of the *empfindsam*, lyric style and of Graun’s oratorio particularly are not absent from Beethoven’s setting, as Richard Kramer has shown. And both nineteenth century and modern critics highlight Christus’s dramatic qualities, which were not without precedent in the oratorios of Albrechtsberger and C.P.E. Bach (and, as Sieghard Brandenburg has argued, were left largely unchanged in the 1804 revisions).

Nevertheless, recent scholarship still positions Christus mainly in relation to the Heiligenstadt Testament, to *Fidelio*, or to an Enlightened view of the human Christ. Now that we can better reconstruct Beethoven’s listening environment—through his relationship with the Tonkünstler-Societät and its regular oratorio performances, his exposure to works of his mentors Haydn and Albrechtsberger, and his personal contact with other composers—there is further evidence to consider. In this paper, I lay the groundwork for a much needed recontextualization of Beethoven’s engagement with the oratorio genre, placing Christus alongside its contemporaries to better understand the work itself and its critical reception.

“Listening to *Fidelio* in Occupied Vienna”

Kirby Haugland (Indiana University Jacobs School of Music)

The first iteration of Ludwig van Beethoven’s opera *Fidelio* infamously failed at the Theater an der Wien in late November 1805. Having survived a close call with state censors and endured other production delays, the opera premiered a week after Napoleon’s Grande

Armée occupied Vienna and closed after only three performances. These events are familiar to Beethoven scholars, documented in correspondence, reviews, and accounts of the composer's friends and colleagues. However, the focus on Beethoven and the performances themselves has made it easy to overlook the more complex experience in Vienna during the autumn of 1805. In this paper, I recontextualize *Fidelio's* premiere through the contemporary lives of the Viennese residents and the French troops who attended—or ignored—the performances at the Theater an der Wien.

Scholars have long sought to better understand the development and contexts for Beethoven's only opera. Helga Lühning's ongoing work on an edition of the 1805 *Leonore* is but the most recent reconstruction project in a series going back to Otto Jahn more than a century and a half ago. Other musicologists such as Michael C. Tusa, Nicholas Mathew, and Martin Nedbal have enriched our understanding about the opera's relationships to French models, Viennese mores, and patriotic symbols.

Cultural and intellectual ties were only part of what performers and audience members brought to the theater. Broadsheet announcements from Austrian and French officials document the city's preparations for invasion, the difficulties of maintaining commerce, and the bumpy management of occupying troops. Sources like these provide insight into the day-to-day experiences that would have primed potential audience members at the Theater an der Wien. *Leonore's* anxieties, Rocco's internal conflict, Pizarro's threats, and even the signal of the trumpet call resonated with recent events in the city. I show that these resonances likely formed another contributing factor to *Fidelio's* initial failure and enrich our understanding of Beethoven's own comments about the opera.

“Lost & Found’. Missing Documents for the Last Piano Sonatas”

Federica Rovelli (University of Pavia-Cremona)

Beethoven research has traditionally focused on the available documents by simply taking note of what is missing, with rare exceptions [e.g. Brandenburg 1978 and Dufner-Lockwood 2015]. The reasons behind such a methodological approach are obvious: why – and especially starting from which evidence – should we talk about something that does not exist? In truth, the shadows cast by ‘lost objects’ on what still exists today are many and often useful in reconstructing several of their details. This is well known by experts in Greek literature and even more so by those in Chinese literature, who are constantly confronted with the ‘phenomenon of loss’, but also by Italianists, who not surprisingly have recently started talking about a real ‘Filologia dei perduti’ [Vela 2021].

With this paper I would like to discuss some of the problems faced during my research on Beethoven's last six Piano Sonatas, starting precisely from the idea that our knowledge of what is now lost can be greatly improved by developing an overview of the surviving documents, but also thanks to what has been revealed to us by studies on the creative process. While on the one hand it is possible to assume the existence of a document today not even mentioned in the thematic catalog, on the other hand it is possible to formulate better hypothesis about the concrete content of the lost source. In other cases, it is our knowledge of the history of these objects before their disappearance that is improved. Some of these suppositions also lead to a revision in the identification of

those documents that still exist today. Among the cases discussed: that of the Sonata op. 106, for which most of the key sources are lost, that of op. 109 – quite puzzling also due to some statements by Beethoven himself –, that of op. 111 for which is attested the existence of an autograph of the second movement that is now lost [Johnson 1973], but also that from the Sonata op. 90, whose autograph is catalogued as Stichvorlage even if it is devoid of the marks generally penned during the printing stages.

“Creating Genius: Beethoven, Ossian, and the Formation of the Musical-Genius Construct”

Paul Moulton (The College of Idaho)

Beethoven revolutionized the perception of the composer as an inspired genius. Several scholars, such as DeNora, Kivy, and Burnham, have attributed the remarkable rise of this musical-genius construct to sociological, philosophical, and musical explanations all centered around Beethoven. Missing among these factors is the powerful role of popular literature in creating a widespread construct that filtered the way people viewed Beethoven.

Writers such as Joseph Addison constructed an eighteenth-century philosophical framework about genius, but James Macpherson’s popular *The Works of Ossian* (1765) had a central role in popularizing the construct. This book of poetry depicted an ancient, blind bard—Ossian—whose inspiration came through otherworldly visitations. Ossian became the Homer of the North, with a supernatural twist. Ossian engrossed readers and inspired composers, artists, and even politicians across Europe and the Americas for a century. Ossian established a new narrative and a construct that would shape the popular perception of Beethoven.

Beethoven himself was enthralled with Ossian, claiming it as one of his favorite books. But there is also evidence of the public seeing him through an Ossianic lens. Several of his contemporaries compared Beethoven to Ossian in both appearance and demeanor. At his funeral, Beethoven was even compared to an Ossian-like bard whose harp had become silent. Several commonalities may have fostered the public seeing Beethoven as an Ossian-like figure, including their unkempt appearances, their “primitive” natures, their medium of music, and their physical limitations that allowed them to seemingly see or hear otherworldly things. The popular image established by Ossian helped foster the construction of the inspired genius that Beethoven would come to so aptly represent.

Session 2: Beethoven from Bonn and Vienna to the Present

“‘The German Children of Israel’—Jewish Sources from late-Eighteenth Century Bonn and their Significance for Beethoven Studies”

Yishai Rubin (Indiana University Jacobs School of Music)

During Ludwig van Beethoven’s early career as a court musician in Bonn of the 1780s and ‘90s, the city experienced a surge of cultural growth, with the formation of institutions such as the University, the *Lese- und Erholungsgesellschaft* and the court theater. These

developments did not pass over the city's Jewish population, which gradually entered those scholarly and intellectual circles. Despite their partial seclusion in a ghetto, the Jewish residents of Bonn participated in the civic environment, achieving considerable success in commerce, finance and medicine, and attaining powerful positions at the Electoral court. Adhering to long-established customs on the one hand and inspired by the breakthroughs of the German Enlightenment on the other, the Jewish community maintained a delicate balance of tradition and innovation—much like Bonn itself.

Jewish sources from Bonn allow a unique perspective into the social tapestry of the city and illuminate various aspects pertinent to Beethoven studies. Focusing on primary sources related to two events—a catastrophic flood of the Rhine in 1784, and a ceremony held at the ghetto's synagogue in 1793 in honor of the Archbishop-Elector Maximilian Franz—I discuss the historical information supplied by these documents, the vivid picture of Jewish-Christian interaction that they convey, and the evidence they transmit of the circulation of political and cultural ideas in Bonn at the time. Although Beethoven's name never comes up in these sources, the documents nevertheless provide details about various individuals known to him, events that affected him and his family, and the civic atmosphere in which he was born, raised, and employed. The 1793 synagogue service also featured a musical performance of a hymn praising the Elector, indicating a culture of poetic and musical creativity within the ghetto that bespeaks the influence of the contemporaneous Enlightenment discourse, in which Beethoven was likewise immersed. As the field of Beethoven studies seeks to expand its scope of primary sources, these Jewish documents—written in German, Hebrew, and Yiddish, and ranging from newspaper reports to rabbinical publications and manuscript copies of synagogue music—open a new and valuable path of such inquiry.

“Concert Life in Vienna 1780-1830: Database Presentation and its Implications for Beethoven Research”

Mary Kirchdorfer and Cheston Humphries (University of Vienna)

Despite the tremendous volume and scope of Beethoven scholarship produced in the two centuries after his death, many of the details concerning the musical-cultural context in which Beethoven worked are less well-explored than one might imagine. Much of what is known about this context remains trapped in literature about specific composers or performers (for instance, Theodore Albrecht's work on the Kärntnertortheater's musicians in the early 1820s). Other literature, such as Mary Sue Morrow's *Concert Life in Haydn's Vienna*, while groundbreaking, can now be expanded upon thanks to the mass digitization of newspapers and other sources. Today systematic efforts to collate this information and disseminate it more widely are sorely needed. The research landscape to date has especially overlooked the contributions of women and musicians from the outer reaches of the Habsburg empire, who make up a significant portion of the musical population. The bigger picture, beyond the performances involving composers such as Beethoven, Mozart, Schubert, and Haydn, consists of thousands of events organized and performed by these relative unknowns, in a variety of unorthodox locations, featuring repertoire which does not enjoy canonical status today (not to mention non-musical content such as tableaux vivant and declamations of poetry).

The ongoing WEAVE/FWF project “Concert Life in Vienna 1780-1830” is tasked with assembling a comprehensive database of all documented performances, persons, repertoire, and venues during this 50 year period. This database aims to consolidate and verify what is already known about Viennese concert life from a wide body of secondary sources, and chip away at what is still unknown by incorporating various primary sources which have been relegated to obscurity. Such a comprehensive database will allow previously invisible networks and forces driving musical culture to emerge and be quantifiable, which may shed new light on Beethoven’s relationship with his broader Viennese musical environment. The aim of this paper is to introduce the database, demonstrate its functionality, and re-situate Beethoven in the pluralistic musical circles in which he moved.

“Political, Moral, and Religious Reflections on Beethoven in the First Musicological Reception Study: *Das romantische Beethovenbild* (1927)”

Sebastian Pstrokonski-Komar (Leipzig University)

One month prior to the premier of Ludwig van Beethoven's Ninth Symphony, another significant debut took place: on April 7, 1824, the *Missa solemnis* was first introduced in St. Petersburg. This composition plays a profound role in Arnold Schmitz's influential monograph *Das romantische Beethovenbild* [The romantic Image of Beethoven] which is now recognized as the seminal work that introduced reception studies into musicology. At that time, Schmitz held the position as the Professor of Medieval Music History in Bonn, just two years before he was appointed *Ordinarius ad personam* in Breslau. Today, he is regarded as one of the most significant German musicologists of the past century and as one of the most prominent early scholars of Beethoven in this field. His book not only had a significant impact on the discipline but also on the contemporary interpretation of Beethoven's music. Since then, reception studies have become an integral part of musicology. It is particularly surprising that although the study received considerable attention since its publication, Schmitz himself, despite his active involvement in the National Socialist *Ostforschung* in Breslau from 1933 onwards, has been scarcely investigated. Biographical and intellectual historical research on him present an entirely new perspective on this early yet groundbreaking work. An examination of the circumstances of its genesis in the still-occupied Rhineland in 1927, within the circle of notable Bonn theologians and under the significant influence of the renowned jurist Carl Schmitt, aims to contribute to the origins of reception studies in musicology. This fresh perspective adds to a deeper, Catholic-motivated understanding that aims to connect Beethoven with a world still imbued in Christian experience. The above-mentioned *Missa solemnis* still serves as a contemporary point of discussion, where Schmitz's classification remains disputable. In this context, it is necessary not only to address his methodology and arguments but also to delve into the intellectual framework both of which are based upon. Given the provided background, an invitation is extended to revisit and reassess *Das romantische Beethovenbild*.

“The Darker Side of Being Haydn’s Friends”

Fabio Morabito (University of Alberta)

I am sitting in the main concert hall of the city where I live, amiskwacîwâskahikan (Beaver Hills House) colonially known as Edmonton, Alberta. On the evening’s program, the line-up is presented succinctly: BRAHMS Piano Trio Op. 87; HIGDON Pale Yellow; BEETHOVEN Piano Trio Op. 97 “Archduke.” As I skim, my neighbour complains: “It’s a lot to assume one should already know who Jennifer Higdon is.” Previous musical knowledge is, of course, leveraged in referring to Ludwig van Beethoven or Johannes Brahms without first names, as if it was impossible to mistake their identity and relevance. To do the same for a contemporary American composer might imply her deserving the same all-caps treatment; or perhaps that the performers felt as familiar with Higdon as with those canonical figures, thus inviting their audience to do the same.

This paper expands on my neighbor’s uneasiness – at being shown she should already possess certain knowledge – by proposing one cultural archaeology, among many possible, of this scenario. A key historical narrative of the European Enlightenment celebrated the advent of observation- and study-based knowledge after centuries of ungrounded beliefs. Bestsellers like Francesco Algarotti’s *Newtonianism for Ladies* (1737) popularized the mantra of “the world becomes a spectacle if you understand it” well beyond scientific circles, shaping a socio-cultural elite through what others did not know. This elitist “darker side” (Mignolo 2011) of Enlightenment sociability has been less a focus in music studies, where sociability tends to be portrayed positively (Klorman’s 2016 *Mozart’s Music of Friends* and Sutcliffe’s 2019 *Haydn, Mozart and Friends* are brilliant examples). I trace how, in the years around 1800, composer Joseph Haydn was evoked as an icon of musical enlightenment and, also, in the “othering” of people with less musical knowledge. My paper reconsiders how being associated with this knowledgeable Haydn-image played a part in the historiography of nineteenth-century musicians like Ludwig van Beethoven and Antoine Reicha. Inspired by how mentioning the Cree name of Edmonton might help not replicate a colonialist regime of knowledge making, this research contributes alternative terms for music historiography to avoid sustaining the project of a social-cultural elite.

Session 3: The Ninth Symphony

“O Friends, Not These SOUNDS: Ignaz Moscheles’s Organ Part, Bowdlerism, and Synesthetic Experiences of the Ninth Symphony in Early Nineteenth-Century London”

Heeseung Lee (University of Northern Colorado)

“Nothing is added to the original text but those words and expressions are omitted which cannot with propriety be read aloud in a family”: Thomas Bowdler, a byword for censors hip in the English-speaking world today, described his intention for changes to Shakespeare’s plays upon publishing *The Family Shakespeare* in London, 1818. In this paper, I will argue that Bowdler’s editorial expurgation for the perceived decency in literature parallels Ignaz Moscheles’s modification to Beethoven’s Ninth Symphony for the

six performances with Philharmonic Society from 1837 to 1843. The focus of my research lies on Moscheles's addition of an organ accompaniment to the finale. I position his approach, especially his pursuit of "the general effect" in English public music-making, as part of the audiovisual culture that began to re-institutionalize a monumental, sublime performance practice at the dawn of the Victorian Era.

On its parochial and patriarchal social and moral grounds that tended to domesticate creative endeavors, I unpack contemporary conceptions of decency and order in music performance, exploring the ensuing tensions with the Ninth, whose sound alone had been dismissed as "some senseless trash" by the Society's Directors (Charlotte Moscheles, 1889). Drawing on recent scholarship in instrumentality, mediation, and media studies, led by Emily I. Dolan (2013) to Deirdre Loughridge (2016), my paper delves into theatricality and spectacle enabled by the organ before the eyes and ears of the contemporary audiences. In reference to Moscheles's organ score and the contemporary performance practices of orchestral-choral music in London, I measure to what extent the organ, as a physical property of sound, would have supported the execution of the finale. From a synesthetic perspective, I also examine how the presence of the organ in the concert venue would have mediated the audiences' experiences of rehearsing the Ninth. In so doing, I illuminate Moscheles's previously overlooked performances of the Ninth in early nineteenth-century London, while reimagining the Ninth and its enduring space within a multisensory, immersive performing culture of artistic expressions, both then and now.

"The *Alla marcia* in Context"

Jos van der Zanden (University of Manchester)

This paper examines the scoring, poetry, symbolism and reception history of the *Alla marcia* section of the Ninth Symphony's finale.

Three issues are brought into relief. The first is the correctness of the term "Turkish march," which is the basis of a great deal of hermeneutical conjecture in the literature. If *Janitscharenmusik* is called "Turkish," it is argued, why does such a connotation not apply to Beethoven's military marches, *Zapfenstreiche*, or *Wellington's Sieg*?

Second, the paper examines the role of the fortepiano at Beethoven's disposal when he stayed in Baden in the summer of 1823. Could the specific qualities of this instrument have influenced the creation of the Ninth, and if so, to what extent might this have had a bearing on the *Alla marcia*?

A final topic is how Schiller's poetic lines stimulated Beethoven's imagination for the *Alla marcia*. It is argued that Schiller's symbolism may have been misread and his metaphors interpreted too literally, which sheds a different light on Beethoven's choice to portray a theatrical, real-life event (marching, triumphing) and to conclude this with an exuberantly joyous double fugue.

“The Ninth Symphony in ‘Tempus Angustiis’

David Levy (Professor Emeritus, Wake Forest University)

Seventeen years have elapsed since the revised edition of my monograph on the Ninth Symphony. We are now celebrating the 200th anniversary of the premiere of this landmark composition. The fact that the Ninth continues not only to remain perpetually in the concert repertory, but also remains a cultural lightning rod, is in itself remarkable. Donald Francis Tovey, writing in 1935, evaluated its place in musical history from the perspective of the era in which he lived and worked. Since that time, countless writers and composers have explored its place in cultural history—and not always favorably—each bringing her own bias. Among the widely diverse points of view, we find a general pushback to Beethoven’s exalted position as cultural icon, as well as more specific objection to the composer’s choice to use—*abuse*, some have suggested—Friedrich Schiller’s *Ode to Joy*. The sheer monumentality of the work has also met with resistance. One prime example of how this quality has been challenged is Leif Inge’s *9 Beet Stretch*, a digital elongation of Beethoven’s Ninth Symphony into a twenty-four hour conceptualization (without pitch distortion) that has been available digitally since its launching in 2002. On the other end of the time continuum, Johannes Kreidlers’ *Compression Sound Art* (2009) has “distilled” the entire symphony into one microsecond. I would suggest that both works, manifestations of early twenty-first century aesthetics, are, in their strange ways, creations that also pay homage to Beethoven’s original. In short, the Ninth still matters.

This paper examines in ways that challenge the optimism expressed in both the music and text of the Ninth Symphony’s finale, both from an historical perspective, as well as in light of current events.

Keynote Address

“The Narrative and Musical Debt of Wagner’s Ring to Beethoven’s Ninth”

Christopher Reynolds (Professor Emeritus, University of California, Davis)

Four years before the opening of the Festspielhaus in Bayreuth, Wagner conducted a performance of Beethoven’s Ninth Symphony to celebrate the laying of the foundation stone. Because no work was more central to Wagner’s musical development and his personal mythology, the appropriateness of this music on this occasion is obvious. And yet, the choice of the Ninth was appropriate for a basic reason that has yet to be recognized: it was a foundation, not just for Wagner’s musical development, but also for that of the *Ring* cycle.

The connection I see between the symphony and the *Ring* is mediated by Wagner’s program for the symphony, which he wrote in 1846 in an attempt to make its musical complexities comprehensible to his Dresden audience. Wagner understood the Ninth to have the following meanings: the opening Allegro announces the problem to be worked out in the ensuing movements, in this case, a struggle between two “powerful combatants,” one good (“a soul striving for joy”), one evil; the Scherzo represents a human search not for joy,

but for happiness; the slow movement expresses love and longing; and the finale brings the arrival of joy and the brotherhood of man, presided over by a benevolent god.

This plan, writ monumentally large, applies remarkably well to the *Ring*. *Das Rheingold* presents a struggle between two gods, Wotan, seemingly good but flawed, and Alberich, who is from the beginning portrayed negatively. *Die Walküre* moves the action to a human level, introducing the mortals Hunding, Sieglinde, and her lover-twin Siegmund; the turn away from divinity is epitomized by the fate of Brünnhilde, who is stripped of her godliness and made human. *Siegfried* then culminates in the discovery of a pure love between Brünnhilde and Siegfried. Then, in the final version of *Götterdämmerung*, the death of a hero leads to the downfall of the gods and the destruction of a flawed old order. Redemption is achieved not by the victory of gods, but by their downfall. Humans, newly liberated, will be responsible for the redemption to come.

I will argue that Wagner amplified the narrative program that he had written for Beethoven's four movements, using it as a key source for the dramatic sequence of his four music dramas. While I will relate narrative details in the *Ring* to Wagner's program for the Ninth, musical correspondences are drawn directly from the Symphony.

***This is the tenth New Beethoven Research Conference, which grew out of an initiative started in 2011. We are grateful for our sponsors, without whom these conferences could not exist. They are:**

The American Beethoven Society, San José, CA;

The University of Alabama, Tuscaloosa, AL;

The Krown Klein endowment fund at the Herb Alpert School of Music, UCLA;

A generous private donor.